

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF EDUCATION AND TRAINING PROGRAMS FOR NON-MILITARY PERSONNEL IN THE INDONESIAN NAVAL

Elpidho Theopilos Menoha Lawahery¹, Sulistiyanto², Wildan Taufik³, Sudirman⁴, Sri Umiyati⁵

^{1,2,3,4,5}Master of Public Administration Study Program

Faculty of Social Science and Political Science, *Hang Tuah University, Surabaya, East Java, Indonesia*

philoz.grace@gmail.com

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.37875/asro.v14i03.517>

Manuscript received 28th July 2023, Revised 18th August 2023, Published 1st September 2023

ABSTRACT

Non-military personnel are a complement (complementary) of Indonesian Armed Forces soldiers. Therefore, Non-Military Personnel and Indonesian Armed Forces soldiers are an integrated unit and are responsible for carrying out the main tasks of the Indonesian Armed Forces. This integration must be reflected in all levels of the organization and must understand the roles of each. The use of Non-Military Personnel within the Indonesian Armed Forces environment is carried out based on the consideration that there are needs and demands for specific tasks that are more effective and efficient when held by Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel, so as to ensure the continuity of the Indonesian Armed Forces's main tasks. The research objectives to be achieved are to describe and analyze the Effectiveness of the Education and Training Program (Training) in the Regulation of the Indonesian Armed Forces Commander Number 161/XII/2011 concerning the Development of Non-Military Personnel in the Account Office of the Regional Financial Officers Koarmada II as well as describe and analyze factors support and inhibitors. The type of research used is qualitative research. The results of the study show the Effectiveness of the Non-Military Personnel Education and Training Program (Training) for Non-Military Personnel in the Regulation of the Indonesian Armed Forces Commander Number 161/XII/2011 to Foster Non-Military Personnel Indonesian Armed Forces Navy Personnel (Case Study of Non-Military Personnel in the Financial Management Accounts of the Regional Military Command II) Based on the 5 variables that the author conveys can be it was concluded that the education and training programs were quite effective in improving the performance of Non-Military Personnel both in terms of knowledge, skills and attitudes and behavior of Non-Military Personnel. The effectiveness of the education and training program (Diklat) on the implementation of education and training to improve the performance of Non-Military Personnel, it can be concluded that with the implementation of education and training many Non-Military Personnel have experienced changes, both changes in behavior and changes in work attitudes.

Keywords: *Effectiveness, Education, Training Program, Non-Military Personnel, Financial Management Accounts.*

1. INTRODUCTION

The success of a government agency or organization in achieving its goals is not only determined by the complete organizational structure or structure but is also influenced by the placement of individuals in the right position according to their abilities and expertise (the right man in the right place). Among all these individuals is a form of work partner who can determine the success or failure of an activity within the agency.

In order to realize a clean and authoritative government system (good governance) as well as realizing good, efficient, effective, and quality public

services, of course, it needs to be supported by the existence of apparatus human resources, especially Non-Military Personnel who are professional, responsible, fair, honest, and competent in their fields. Therefore, a kind of assessment must be carried out on the performance of everyone who is expected to be able to carry out organizational tasks. The quality of human resources cannot always be maintained over a long period of time. The mission of the organization is in accordance with its goals for developing and nurturing human resources, with the aim of ensuring the availability of high-quality resources and successfully attaining objectives. To attain the objectives set forth by the organization, it

is imperative that employees demonstrate exceptional performance in their current roles to progress to more advanced positions. This is mainly supported by the agency's ability to understand the psychological aspects that underlie employees' work.

Non-military personnel are not only elements of the State Apparatus but are also State Servants and Community Servants, who live during society and work for the benefit of society. Therefore, in carrying out coaching, Non-Military Personnel are not only seen and treated as citizens. This implies that in carrying out coaching, as far as possible there should be harmony between the interests of the service and the interests of the Non-Military Personnel as an individual, with the provision that if there is a difference between the interests of the service and the interests of the Non-Military Personnel as an individual, then the interests of the service shall take priority.

Non-military personnel are a complement of Indonesian Armed Forces soldiers. Therefore, Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel and Indonesian Armed Forces soldiers constitute an integrated unit and are responsible for carrying out the main tasks of the Indonesian Armed Forces. This integration must be reflected in all levels of the organization and must understand the roles of each. The use of Non-Military Personnel within the Indonesian Armed Forces environment is carried out based on the consideration that there are needs and demands for certain tasks that are more effective and efficient when held by Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel, to ensure the continuity of the Indonesian Armed Forces' main tasks. Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel have the same position as other Non-Military Personnel. Therefore, in implementing the training, in addition to being based on the provisions and laws that apply to Non-Military Personnel in general, it is also based on the provisions and policies issued by the Indonesian Armed Forces Commander (Regulation Number 161/XII/2011 dated 16 December 2011) "concerning Instructions Administration of the Development of Non-Military Personnel of the Indonesian Armed Forces". Non-Military Personnel since the nature of the assignment, position and to obtain optimal benefits in use.

The development of Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel involves broad and complex issues over a long period of time, so in practice, there is a need for compatibility between situations and conditions with the main tasks of the Indonesian Armed Forces organization. The development of Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel aims to prepare Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel as elements of the state apparatus that are professional, have

national insight, and are disciplined, prosperous, and responsible.

Development of Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel is all efforts, work, and activities including planning, organizing, directing, and controlling Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel starting from procurement, education and training activities, use, and maintenance, up to effective and efficient separation to support the main tasks of the Indonesian Armed Forces. The use of Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel is directed to carry out non-combat duties and every Non-Military Personnel gets the same opportunity in career development as wide as possible in accordance with the development of knowledge which is very necessary for the Indonesian Armed Forces organization. Recognizing the importance of the role of government officials in increasing work quality loyalty and dedication to their work, especially in the face of increasingly fierce competition in their work environment, consequently, the condition of the apparatus itself needs to be educated and trained.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Effectiveness

The term "effective" is derived from the English language and refers to achieving success or accomplishing something successfully. The word "effective" can be used to describe something that works well and produces the intended or expected result. It can also mean having a particular role or result in practice, though not officially or in theory. When something is deemed effective, it means it has an intended or expected outcome, or produces a deep, vivid impression. The word "effective" puts more attention on the actual ability to produce a desired result. People can also be described as effective when they accomplish what they set out to accomplish, but the word is far more often applied to things. "Effectiveness" is the main noun form of the adjective "effective," which means "adequate to accomplish a purpose; producing the intended or expected result". Effectiveness is generally viewed as the level of achievement of operative and operational objectives. Basically, effectiveness is the level of achievement of the assigned organizational goals. Effectiveness is how well the work is done, and the extent to which a person produces output as expected. This can be interpreted if a job can be carried out according to plan, it can be said to be effective without regard to time, effort, and others. The effectiveness of the implementation of education and training for regional employees is the extent to which the activities of regional employees can carry out, realize, and improve services to the community, make community participation decisions, carry out development, and solve various problems in the implementation of regional civil service works.

There are four factors that affect organizational effectiveness, namely:

- a. Organizational characteristics consist of organizational structure and technology, where structure is an organizational way of arranging people to create an organization.
- b. The characteristics of the environment achieve two interconnected aspects, namely the external environment and the internal environment. External environment, namely all environmental forces that arise outside the boundaries of the organization. The internal environment is generally known as the organizational climate which includes various environmental attributes only.
- c. The characteristics of the work environment have different views of needs and abilities, where everyone has a direct influence on the sense of belonging to the organization and work performance.
- d. Management policies and practices are needed by an organization to realize success through planning and coordination, to expedite the activities aimed at the target.

2.2. Public Effectiveness Concept

The concept of public effectiveness refers to the ability of public policies, programs, and practices to achieve their intended goals and produce positive outcomes for the public (Nagel, 1986). It is a multidimensional concept that encompasses efficiency, effectiveness, and equity. Efficiency refers to the ability to achieve goals with minimum resources, while effectiveness refers to the ability to achieve goals with maximum impact (Cohen, 1993). Equity refers to fairness and justice in the distribution of resources and outcomes. Public effectiveness is an important concept in public management and administration, as it helps to ensure that public resources are used efficiently and effectively to meet the needs of the public. To measure public effectiveness, decision analyses and modeling techniques are used to assess the impact of public policies, programs, and practices on health outcomes, safety, and costs. The study of public effectiveness is rooted in Woodrow Wilson's famous essay on public administration which called for the study of the field along professional lines.

Public services are carried out by the government with the aim of meeting the needs of the community regarding the rights they have, the government functions as a maker, seller, and distributor, while the people are buyers, buyers, and recipients of government products. The relationship between the government and those who are governed in this situation is likened to the relationship between producers and consumers and is called a transactional or transformational relationship.

The main core of service effectiveness is developing forms of service management that are fast, easy, smooth, and of good quality and

managing or managing various service administrations that must be accessed neatly, regularly, and in accordance with the forms of input, process, output, outcome, and impact. The considerations regarding smooth service management and regular, orderly, and smoothly archived data access are indicators in determining effective service according to input (receiving all forms of service), process (processing incoming data), output (finished processing), outcome (completion of administrative registration), and impact (reporting of services served).

2.3. Public policy

Public policy is a government decision or action taken to overcome public problems. The following will explain several definitions of public policy according to experts so that they have the same intent and understanding in this study. Public policy pertains to the deliberate actions undertaken by the government to tackle issues and concerns.

Public policies have quite a series, but in simple terms, they can be grouped into three types:

- a. Public policies that are macro general or basic in nature (Laws, Government Regulations, Presidential Regulations, and Regional Regulations)
- b. Public policies that are messy or medium in nature, or implementing explanations (Ministry Regulations, Ministerial Circulars, Governor Regulations, Regent Regulations, and Mayors)
- c. Public policies that are micro in nature are policies that regulate the implementation of policies on it, the form of policies are regulations issued by public officials under ministers, governors, regents, and mayors.

2.4. Public Policy Evaluation

Evaluation has related meanings, each referring to the application of some value scale to the results of policies and programs. In general, the term evaluation can be equated with appraisal, rating, and assessment, words that express efforts to analyze policy outcomes in terms of their value units. In a more specific sense, evaluation relates to the production of information regarding the value or benefits of policy outcomes. When policy outcomes do in fact have value, they therefore contribute to goals or objectives. In this case, it can be said that the policy or program has reached a meaningful level of performance, which means that policy issues are made clear or resolved.

Evaluation is needed to see the gap between expectations and reality. Evaluation is carried out because not all public policy programs achieve the desired results. It often happens that public policies fail to achieve the aims or objectives that have been set previously. Thus, policy evaluation is intended to look at the causes of the failure of a policy or to find out whether the public policy that has been

implemented has had the desired effect. In shorter language evaluation is an activity that aims to assess the "benefits" of a policy.

Policy evaluation is an activity involving the estimation or assessment of policies that include substance, implementation, and impact (Anderson: 1975). Policy evaluation is seen as a functional activity. This means that policy evaluation is not only carried out at the final stage but for the entire policy process.

Evaluation dimensions include:

- a. Evaluation of the policy-making process or before the policy is implemented. At this stage, according to Palumbo, two evaluations are needed, namely.
- b. Formative Evaluation which is carried out when the policy implementation process is ongoing or is being implemented. The purpose of this formative evaluation is primarily to find out how far a program has been implemented and what conditions can be pursued to increase its success. In management terms, formative evaluation is monitoring the application of policies. Formative evaluation involves a lot of quantitative measurements as a measurement of implementation performance. (Note: Thus, implementation studies as we know them so far, with implementation models, are part of formative evaluation studies)
- c. Summative Evaluation which is carried out when the policy has been implemented and has an impact. The purpose of this Summative evaluation is to measure how the effectiveness of the policy/program has a real impact on the problems being handled

3. RESEARCH METHODS

This research uses a qualitative method with approach descriptive study that employs a qualitative approach to analyze data and information pertaining to the research questions. The data is gathered through a combination of literature reviews and in-depth interviews with knowledgeable individuals who possess relevant information related to the research topics. Subsequently, the data is subjected to qualitative analysis, and the findings are interpreted based on the inherent meanings derived from the data and information. This research approach allows for a comprehensive exploration of the research problems, offering insights derived from both existing literature and firsthand perspectives obtained through interviews with experts in the field.

4. DISCUSSION AND RESULTS

4.1. The Effectiveness of the Education and Training Program for Non-Military Personnel (Non-Military Personnel)

The use of Non-Military Personnel within the Indonesian Armed Forces environment is carried out on the consideration that there are positions in the Indonesian Armed Forces organization that are more effectively and efficiently held by Non-Military Personnel and because of the nature of assignments which are generally in non-combat fields which are relatively stationary. Non-Military Personnel apart from being fostered in accordance with the interests of the Indonesian Armed Forces organization are also fostered according to the rules/conditions that apply to Non-Military Personnel in general.

The objectives of Education and Training for Non-Military Personnel in the PERPANG/161 /2011 dated 6 December 2011 include:

- a. Enhance the knowledge, skills, and ethics to execute your job with professionalism and fulfill the demands of the agency.
 - b. Creating apparatus capable of acting as a reformer and glue for national unity and integrity.
 - c. Strengthening the attitude and spirit of dedication that is oriented towards serving and protecting the community
 - d. Creating a common vision and dynamics of mindset in carrying out general governance and development tasks for the sake of good governance.
- Types of Education and Training for Non-Military Personnel in the Indonesian Armed Forces Commander Regulation Number PERPANG/161/XII/2011 concerning Administration Guidelines for Non-Military Personnel Development, namely:

a. Education and Training for State Defense

The State Defense Training aims to form Non-Military Personnel who have the mental attitude, physical freshness, and discipline in accordance with their character and character, and are one of the requirements for first promotion. The National Defense Training Curriculum is determined by the Armed Forces Headquarters in the Field of Physical Development studies, the Field of Professional Basic Knowledge and Skills studies, the Field of Military Fundamentals studies, and the Field of Task Debriefing studies.

b. Pre-service Education and Training

Pre-service Education and Training are intended for National Non-Military Personnel of the Indonesian National Armed Forces National Non-Military Personnel of the National Armed Forces levels 1, 2, and 3, aiming to provide knowledge in the context of forming national insights, personality, and ethics of Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel in addition to basic knowledge about the system of administering state government, fields of

duties and organizational culture so that they are able to carry out their duties within the military organization. Provision of Class Transfer of Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel.

The curriculum is determined by the State Administrative Institute of the Republic of Indonesia as the Non-Military Personnel Education and Training Supervisor except for Substance lessons tailored to the needs of the Indonesian Armed Forces organization.

c. In-service Education and Training.

Organizers of Pre-service Training are the Ministry of Defense for Class III National Non-Military Personnel Pre-service Training; Indonesian Armed Forces Headquarters for Class I, II Non-Military Personnel Pre-service Training within the Indonesian Armed Forces Headquarters and Class III Non-Military Personnel Substance in the ranks of the Indonesian Armed Forces; Forces for Non-Military Personnel Pre-service Training Classes I and II.

d. Debriefing of Class Transfer of Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel

Debriefing for Transfer of Military Non-Military Personnel is training intended for Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel who have switched class II from Group III with the following requirements: Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel taking the Kindergarten Service Exam. I who has been declared passed; Non-Military Personnel of the Indonesian Armed Forces participating in the Adjustment Examination for Advancement in Rank who has been declared passed; Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel who hold a Strata I or Diploma IV diploma; Indonesian Armed Forces Non-Military Personnel who are promoted to class III/A through functional position levels.

e. In-service Education and Training

In-service Education and Training consists of Leadership Education and Training, Functional Training, and Technical Training. For Education and Training, there are 4 levels, including Level I Education and Training for Position Groups III, II, and I; Level II Education and Training for Position Group IV; Level III Education and Training for Position Groups VI and V; and Level IV Education and Training for Classes IX, VIII, and VII. Meanwhile, Functional Training is intended for Non-Military Personnel who will and or have occupied functional positions. Technical training is carried out to achieve the technical competencies required for the implementation of the duties of Non-Military Personnel.

4.2 Understanding of Non-Military Personnel Education and Training Programs

In general, Education/Training (Training) aims to provide opportunities for personnel to improve

their skills and abilities, especially in areas related to leadership or managerial which are needed in achieving organizational goals.

Based on Government Regulation Number 101 of 2000 concerning Education/Training (Training) for Employee Positions articles 2 and 3, Training (Education/Training (Training)) aims to:

a. Increasing the knowledge, skills, and attitudes to be able to carry out the duties of the position operationally based on the ethical personality of Non-Military Personnel in accordance with the needs of the agency,

b. Creating apparatus capable of acting as a reformer and glue for the unity and integrity of the nation,

c. Strengthening the attitude and spirit of personality that is oriented towards service, protection, community empowerment,

d) Creating a common vision and dynamic pattern of thinking in carrying out government and development tasks for the realization of good governance.

The results of the research show that the education and training of members the results of this research mean that the Education and Training (Training) of Non-Military Personnel is a very necessary factor in improving the performance of the apparatus. And because education and training are the main means or instruments in developing the competence of knowledge, skills, and attitudes of apparatus, the policy direction for developing human resources for apparatus must optimize the implementation of Non-Military Personnel education and training, both Structural/Leadership Training and Technical and Functional Training.

4.3 Right-on-Target Non-Military Personnel Education and Training Program

There are three indicators for measuring effectiveness, as follows:

a. Achieving goals is the overall effort to achieve goals must be seen as a process. Therefore, in order to secure the achievement of the final goal, phases are needed, both in terms of the stages of achieving the parts and the stages in terms of priorities. The achievement of the goals consists of two sub-indicators, namely: targets and timeframes which are concrete targets.

b. Integration is measuring the level of organizational ability to communicate or socialize and develop consensus. Integration concerns the process of socialization.

c. Adaptation is the ability of an organization to adapt to its environment. With regard to the suitability of program implementers with conditions in the field, measuring the effectiveness of a program can be done using the following variables:

- 1) Program target accuracy Namely the extent to which program participants are right on target that has been determined previously.
- 2) Program socialization Namely the ability of program organizers to socialize the program so that information about program implementation can be conveyed to the public in general and the target program participants in particular.
- 3) Program objectives Namely the extent of conformity between the results of program implementation and program objectives that have been previously set.
- 4) Program monitoring Namely activities carried out after the implementation of the program as a form of attention to program participants.

Non-Military Personnel education and training, hereinafter referred to as education and training program, is the process of organizing teaching and learning in order to improve the Knowledge, Attitude, and Moral Insights of Non-Military Personnel. Training Aims:

- a. Increase the knowledge, expertise, skills, and attitudes to be able to carry out the duties of a position in a professional manner based on the personality and ethics of Non-Military Personnel in accordance with the needs of the agency;
- b. Creating apparatus capable of acting as a reformer and glue for unity and cohesion;
- c. Strengthening the attitude and spirit of dedication that is oriented towards service, protection, and community empowerment;
- d. Creating a common vision and mindset dynamics in carrying out general administration and development tasks for the realization of good governance.

The development of apparatus human resources aims to improve the performance of employees who work unsatisfactorily due to a lack of skills. In addition, employee development basically aims to ensure and maintain the ability of employees so that they meet the required qualifications so that they can provide optimal contributions to the organization. One form of employee development is education and training.

4.4 Real Changes from the Education and Training Program for Non-Military Personnel

Education and Training (Training) is the process of organizing teaching and learning to improve the capabilities of Non-Military Personnel. Training is a planned process of changing attitudes/behaviors, knowledge, and skills through learning experiences to achieve effective performance in an activity or several activities.

Training is intended to improve employee skills both horizontally and vertically. Horizontally means broadening the skills of a known type of work, while vertically deepening one field.

Effective training is not just telling or showing someone how to do a task but an effort to transfer skills and knowledge so that trainees receive and do the training while doing their jobs. Trainees must learn specific skills or techniques that can be demonstrated and observed in the workplace.

The head of the organization has responsibility for delivering general policies and procedures needed in implementing training programs and exercising administrative control over the implementation of training programs. The staffing or personnel department essentially provides support to employees and staff and assists line management in training and development by providing resources in training programs.

4.5 Supporting Factors for the Effectiveness of the Education and Training Program in the Regulation of the Indonesian Armed Forces Commander Number 161/XII/2011.

The training program is considered effective if the implementation of the training is fun and satisfying for the training participants so that the participants are motivated to learn. In other words, training participants will be motivated if the implementation of the training goes well and smoothly, which in the end the training participants will elicit a positive reaction and vice versa if the training participants are not satisfied with the implementation of the training, it will cause a negative reaction. Almost all the alumni of training participants at the Malang Regency Regional Personnel Board have mastered the concept of implementing training well. b. Learnings Training participants are said to have learned when they have experienced a change in attitude, improved knowledge, or improved skills. Therefore, to measure the effectiveness of the education and training program, these three aspects need to be measured. Without a change in attitude, an increase in knowledge, or an improvement in the skills of the training participants, the education and training program can be said to be a failure.

This behavior evaluation looks at changes in the behavior of the training participants after returning to the workplace. With the implementation of education and training, many employees have experienced changes, be it changes in behavior or changes in attitudes at work. This happened because after participating in the education and training, there was an increase in competence both in terms of knowledge, skills and the attitudes and behavior of the training participants, in general, had become better, the awareness in Non-Military Personnel to complete their jobs was much better and their performance had increased than before.

follow the training. Organizational Result There are several alternative explanations or new results. Because of the difficulty in identifying these new outcomes, many organizational members justify training by assuming that training and development have an impact on organizational effectiveness

4.6 Factors Inhibiting the Effectiveness of the Education and Training Program in the Regulation of the Indonesian Armed Forces Commander Number 161/XII/2011.

Internal training factors are factors that exist within and arise from the training system itself. Internal factors contained or provided by training implementing agencies include training program procedures and elements that must be present in training.

a. Training Program Procedures Training procedures aim to measure the level of accuracy of training plans to obtain timely and targeted training results.

b. Training procedures include planning and preparation to be used as a guide for training programs in efforts to develop human resource competencies.

c. The systemic model training procedure emphasizes the important components of training, namely assessing training needs to evaluating training.

For the training carried out to run effectively and with quality, the training program must be designed with quality and provide added value to an organization, individual, and improvement of the program. After that, the stages of elaborating the essence of the expected HR competencies are needed.

5. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

5.1 Conclusions

Based on the results and discussions, we can draw some conclusions:

a. It can be concluded that education and training programs have been quite effective in improving the performance of Non-Military Personnel both in terms of knowledge, skills and attitudes, and behavior of Non-Military Personnel. The effectiveness of education and training programs on the implementation of education and training to improve the performance of Non-Military Personnel, it can be concluded that with the implementation of education and training many Non-Military Personnel have experienced changes, both changes in behavior and changes in work attitudes.

b. Factors that support the effectiveness of education and training in improving employee performance, including education and training policies where education and training are given to obtain the skill requirements needed to carry out

Non-Military Personnel duties and have indicators of motivation or the purpose of employees to participate in education and training. Then it was also stated that the inhibiting factor for the effectiveness of education and training in improving the performance of Non-Military Personnel, namely the limited budget for education and training.

5.2 Suggestions

Based on the results of a study entitled The Effectiveness of the Education and Training Program the Regulation of the Commander of the Indonesian Armed Forces Number 161/XII/2011 has several suggestions recommended by researchers, among others:

a. One effort can be made so that the education and training program continues to run, managing the existing budget as well as possible by training Non-Military Personnel in accordance with the established Training Needs Analysis so that the budget spent is not in vain or just wasted.

b. It is necessary to have factors that encourage Non-Military Personnel to attend education and training such as promotion, job fulfillment awards, and the desire to increase competence. This is very necessary so that Non-Military Personnel can achieve more optimal results, thus increasing their own work performance.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The authors greatly acknowledge the support from Faculty of Social Science and Political Science, Hang Tuah University, Surabaya Indonesia for providing the necessary resources to carry out this research work. The authors are also grateful to the anonymous reviewers and journal editorial board for their many insightful comments, which have significantly improved this article.

REFERENCES

- Ambar Teguh Sulistiyani. 2009. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu.
- Amirullah. 2015. *Pengantar Manajemen, Fungsi-Proses-Pengendalian*. Jakarta: Mitra Wacana Media.
- As'ad. 1987. *Psikologi Industri*. Yogyakarta: Liberty.
- Atmodiwirio, Soebagio, 2002. *Manajemen Pelatihan*. Jakarta: Ardadizya Jaya.
- Atmodiwirio, Soebagio. 1993. *Manajemen Training: Pedoman Praktis bagi Penyelenggara Training*. Jakarta: Balai Pustaka.

- Barry, W. 1983. *Dermatological Formulations, Percutaneous Absorption*. New York: Marcel Dekker Inc.
- Batinggi, Ahmad. 1997. *Model Pelayanan Umum. Ujung Pandang*.
- Boediono, 1996. *Pelayanan Prima*. Jakarta: Yayasan Kawula Indonesia.
- Bumi Aksara.
- Creswell, John W. 2007. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among Five Approaches*. Illinois: Sage Publications Inc
- Duverger, Maurice, 2005. *Sosiologi Politik*. Penerjemah, Daniel Dhakidae, Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Hasibuan, Malayu, 1996. *Organisasi dan Motivasi & Dasar-Dasar Peningkatan Produktivitas*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Hasibuan, Malayu. 2001. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Husein, Umar. 2005. *Riset Pemasaran dan Perilaku Konsumen*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Husein, Umar. 1999. *Riset Sumber Daya Manusia Dalam Organisasi*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Kristadi, J. B, 1994. *Administrasi Manajemen Pembangunan*. LAN, Jakarta.
- Lincoln, Y.S. dan Guba, E.G. 1985. *Naturalistic Inquiry*. Beverly Hills: Sage Publication
- Lubis, S.M. Hari & Huseini, Martani. 1987. *Teori Organisasi: Suatu Pendekatan Makro*. Jakarta: Pusat Antar Universitas Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial
- Makmur. 2013. *Patologi Serta terapinya dalam Ilmu Administrasi dan Organisasi*. Bandung: PT Refika Aditama.
- Malik, Djamaluddin Dedy. 2012. *Birokrasi Masa Depan*. Bandung: Mutiara Press
- Margono, Arifin. 2003. *Pelayanan Kependudukan dan Masyarakat*.
- Moenir, H.A.S. 2006. *Manajemen Pelayanan Umum di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Moleong, Lexy. J. 2000. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya
- Nakula, Sadewa. 2004. *Pelayanan Administrasi Publik*. Yogyakarta: Andi.
- Napitupulu, Paimin, 2007, *Pelayanan Publik & Customer Satisfaction*. Bandung. PT. Alumni.
- Nawawi, Ismail. 2014. *Manajemen Perubahan*. Bogor: Ghalia Indonesia.
- Notoatmodjo, Soekidjo. 2009. *Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- Nurmandi, Achmad. 2010. *Manajemen Pelayanan Publik*. Yogyakarta: PT. Sinergi Visi Utama.
- Rohman, dkk. 2010. *Reformasi Pelayanan Publik*. Malang: ISBN.
- Sastrohadiwiryo, B. Siswanto. 2005. *Manajemen Tenaga Kerja Indonesia Pendekatan administratif dan Operasional*. Jakarta:
- Satrianegara, Fais. 2012. *Organisasi dan Fungsi Manajemen Layanan Kesehatan*. Makassar: Alauddin University Press.
- Siagian, Sondang P. 2005. *Fungsi-fungsi Manajemen*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Siagian, Sondang P. 2001. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Simamora, Henry. 1997. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Yogyakarta: STIE YKPN.
- Soekanto, Soerjono. 2006. *Sosiologi, Suatu Pengantar Ilmu*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Steers, Richard. M. 2005. *Efektivitas Organisasi*. (Terjemahan). Jakarta: Surabaya: Buana Ilmu.
- Syahrizal. 1998. *Pelayanan dalam Tinjauan Administrasi Birokrasi*. Yogyakarta: Liberty.
- Syamsuddin. 2004. *Efektivitas Pelayanan Administrasi*. Jakarta: Harvarindo.
- Tentara Nasional Indonesia. 2011. *Peraturan Panglima Tentara Nasional Indonesia. Nomor 161 Tahun 2011 tentang Petunjuk Administrasi Pembinaan Personel Pegawai Negeri Sipil (NON-MILITARY PERSONNEL) Tentara Nasional Indonesia (INDONESIAN ARMED FORCES)*. Jakarta.
- Thoha, Miftah, 2002, *Perilaku Organisasi*, Fisipol Universitas Gajah Mada, Penerbit PT Raja Grafindo Persada, Jakarta.

- Umar, Husein, 2002, Metode Riset Bisnis, Cetakan Pertama, Penerbit PT.Gramedia, Jakarta
- Umar, Husein. 1999. Riset Sumber Daya Manusia Dalam Organisasi.Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Wahyudi, Bambang, 2002, *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*, edisi Revisi,Bandung: Sulita.
- Waworuntu, B. 1997. Dasar-Dasar Keterampilan Abdi Negara MelayaniMasyarakat. Jakarta: PT. Gramedia.
- Widodo, Joko, 2007. Membangun Birokrasi Berbasis Kinerja, Malang.Anggota IKPI.
- Zacky, Fadhel Muhamad, 2022. "Efektivitas Program Pendidikan Dan Pelatihan (Diklat) Dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Pegawai Negeri Sipil Kecamatan Koto Tangah Kota Padang Provinsi Sumatera Barat": Jurnal Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri IPDN